

Tod V. Beebe, A Professional Corporation (SBN 100265)  
Christopher D. Higashi, A Professional Corporation (SBN 168667)  
BARTON, KLUGMAN & OETTING LLP  
350 South Grand Avenue  
Suite 2200  
Los Angeles, CA 90071-3454  
Telephone: 213-621-4000  
Facsimile: 213-625-1832  
E-mail: tbeebe@bkolaw.com

Attorneys for Defendant  
MUFG UNION BANK, N.A.

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA – WESTERN DIVISION**

ALEXANDRA BARILARI, an  
individual,

Plaintiff,

vs.

MUFG UNION BANK, a national  
banking association; TRANS UNION,  
LLC, a Delaware limited liability  
company, and DOES 1-10, inclusive,  
Defendants.

Case No. 2:18-cv-8928 SJO (JEMx)  
*Assigned to the Hon. S. James Otero,  
Ctm. 10C*

**STIPULATION AND  
PROTECTIVE ORDER**

Complaint Filed: October 16, 2018  
Trial Date: January 7, 2020

1 IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED by and between the Parties to *Alexandra*  
2 *Barilari v. MUFG Union Bank; Trans Union, LLC*, by and through their respective  
3 counsel of record, that in order to facilitate the exchange of information and  
4 documents which may be subject to confidentiality limitations on disclosure due to  
5 federal laws, state laws, and privacy rights, the Parties stipulate as follows:

6 **1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS**

7 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,  
8 proprietary or private information for which special protection from public  
9 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than pursuing this litigation may be  
10 warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to  
11 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this  
12 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to  
13 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends  
14 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment  
15 under the applicable legal principles.

16 **2. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT**

17 This action is likely to involve policies and procedures, trade secrets,  
18 consumer information, commercial, financial, technical and/or proprietary  
19 information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for  
20 any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential  
21 and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things, policies  
22 and procedures, consumer information, confidential business or financial  
23 information, information regarding confidential business practices, or other  
24 confidential research, development, or commercial information (including  
25 information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise  
26 generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise  
27 protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions,  
28 or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the

prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

### **3. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF UNDER SEAL FILING PROCEDURE**

The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 14.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; *Local Civil Rule 79-5* sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal. There is a strong presumption that the public has a right of access to judicial proceedings and records in civil cases. In connection with non-dispositive motions, good cause must be shown to support a filing under seal. *See Kamakana v. City and County of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1176 (9th Cir. 2006), *Phillips v. Gen. Motors Corp.*, 307 F.3d 1206, 1210-11 (9th Cir. 2002), *Makar-Welbon v. Sony Electronics, Inc.*, 187 F.R.D. 576, 577 (E.D. Wis. 1999) (even stipulated protective orders require good cause showing), and a specific showing of good cause or compelling reasons with proper evidentiary support and legal justification, must be made with respect to Protected Material that a party seeks to file under seal. The parties' mere designation of Disclosure or Discovery Material as CONFIDENTIAL does not – without the submission of competent evidence by declaration, establishing that the material sought to be filed under seal qualifies as confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable constitute good cause.

Further, if a party requests sealing related to a dispositive motion or trial, then compelling reasons, not only good cause, for the sealing must be shown, and the relief sought shall be narrowly tailored to serve the specific interest to be protected. *See Pintos v. Pacific Creditors Ass’n.*, 605 F.3d 665, 677-79 (9<sup>th</sup> Cir. 2010). For each item or type of information, document, or thing sought to be filed or introduced under seal, the party seeking protection must articulate compelling reasons, supported by specific facts and legal justification, for the requested sealing order. Again, competent evidence supporting the application to file documents under seal must be provided by declaration.

Any document that is not confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable in its entirety will not be filed under seal if the confidential portions can be redacted. If documents can be redacted, then a redacted version for public viewing, omitting only the confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable portions of the document, shall be filed. Any application that seeks to file documents under seal in their entirety should include an explanation of why redaction is not feasible.

#### **4. DEFINITIONS**

4.1 Action: Alexandra Barilari v. MUFG Union Bank; Trans Union, LLC; U.S.D.C. Case No. 2:18-cv-8928 SJO (JEMx).

4.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

4.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under *Federal Rule of Civil Procedure* 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.

4.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

1           4.5    Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information  
2 or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as  
3 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

4           4.6    Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless  
5 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,  
6 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced  
7 or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery.

8           4.7    Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a  
9 matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to  
10 serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

11          4.8    House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this  
12 Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other  
13 outside counsel.

14          4.9    Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association  
15 or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

16          4.10   Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a  
17 party to this Action but are retained to represent a party to this Action and have  
18 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm that  
19 has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

20          4.11   Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,  
21 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their  
22 support staffs).

23          4.12   Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or  
24 Discovery Material in this Action.

25          4.13   Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation  
26 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or  
27 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)  
28 and their employees and subcontractors.

1           4.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is  
2 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

3           4.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery  
4 Material from a Producing Party.

5       **5. SCOPE**

6           The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only  
7 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or  
8 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or  
9 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or  
10 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

11           Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the  
12 trial judge and other applicable authorities. This Order does not govern the use of  
13 Protected Material at trial.

14       **6. DURATION**

15           Once a case proceeds to trial, information that was designated as  
16 CONFIDENTIAL or maintained pursuant to this protective order used or  
17 introduced as an exhibit at trial becomes public and will be presumptively  
18 available to all members of the public, including the press, unless compelling  
19 reasons supported by specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the  
20 trial judge in advance of the trial. *See Kamakana*, 447 F.3d at 1180-81  
21 (distinguishing “good cause” showing for sealing documents produced in  
22 discovery from “compelling reasons” standard when merits-related documents are  
23 part of court record). Accordingly, the terms of this protective order do not extend  
24 beyond the commencement of the trial.

25       **7. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL**

26           7.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.  
27 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under  
28 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that

1 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate  
2 for protection only those parts of material, documents, items or oral or written  
3 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,  
4 items or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept  
5 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

6 Mass, indiscriminate or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations  
7 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper  
8 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to  
9 impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the  
10 Designating Party to sanctions.

11 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it  
12 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must  
13 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

14 7.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in  
15 this Order, or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure of Discovery Material  
16 that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before  
17 the material is disclosed or produced.

18 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

19 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic  
20 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial  
21 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend  
22 "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that  
23 contains protected material. If only a portion of the material on a page qualifies for  
24 protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s)  
25 (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

26 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection  
27 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated  
28 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and

1 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be  
2 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the  
3 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine  
4 which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order.  
5 Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix  
6 the “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If  
7 only a portion of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing  
8 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making  
9 appropriate markings in the margins).

10 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party  
11 identifies the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of  
12 the deposition all protected testimony.

13 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary  
14 and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent  
15 place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is  
16 stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the  
17 information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable,  
18 shall identify the protected portion(s).

19 7.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent  
20 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive  
21 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such  
22 material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make  
23 reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the  
24 provisions of this Order.

25 **8. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

26 8.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a  
27 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s  
28 Scheduling Order.



1           8.2   Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute  
2 resolution process under *Local Rule 37-1, et seq.*

3           8.3   Joint Stipulation. Any challenge submitted to the Court shall be via a  
4 joint stipulation pursuant to *Local Rule 37-2*.

5           8.4   Burden of Persuasion. The burden of persuasion in any such  
6 challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and  
7 those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary  
8 expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to  
9 sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the  
10 confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the material in  
11 question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's  
12 designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

13   **9.   ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

14           9.1   Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that  
15 is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this  
16 Action only for prosecuting, defending or attempting to settle this Action. Such  
17 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under  
18 the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a  
19 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 15 below (FINAL  
20 DISPOSITION).

21           Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a  
22 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons  
23 authorized under this Order.

24           9.2   Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless  
25 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a  
26 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated  
27 "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:  
28

1 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action,  
2 as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably  
3 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

4 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House  
5 Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for  
6 this Action;

7 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to  
8 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the  
9 "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

10 (d) the court and its personnel;

11 (e) court reporters and their staff;

12 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and  
13 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action  
14 and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound"  
15 (Exhibit A);

16 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the  
17 information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the  
18 information;

19 (h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses,  
20 in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the  
21 deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto;  
22 and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they  
23 sign the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A), unless  
24 otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of  
25 transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected  
26 Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed  
27 to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and  
28

(i) any mediators or settlement officers and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

**10. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED  
PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION**

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected. If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

**11. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE  
PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

(a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such

information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

(b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

(1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

(3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.

(c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

## **12. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized

under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment an Agreement to Be Bound” attached hereto as Exhibit A.

**13. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL**

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in *Federal Rule of Civil Procedure* 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to *Federal Rule of Evidence* 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the Court.

**14. MISCELLANEOUS**

14.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

14.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

1           14.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any  
2 Protected Material must comply with *Local Civil Rule 79-5*. Protected Material  
3 may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the  
4 specific Protected Material. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under  
5 seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the  
6 public record unless otherwise instructed by the Court.

7 **15. FINAL DISPOSITION**

8           After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 6, within  
9 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must  
10 return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As  
11 used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts,  
12 compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the  
13 Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the  
14 Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if  
15 not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60-day deadline that  
16 (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was  
17 returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any  
18 copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or  
19 capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel  
20 are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial,  
21 deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition  
22 and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert  
23 work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such  
24 archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this  
25 Protective Order as set forth in Section 6 (DURATION).

1 **16. VIOLATION**

2 Any violation of this Order may be punished by appropriate measures  
3 including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

4 **IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.**

5  
6 Dated: May 13, 2019

BARTON KLUGMAN & OETTING, LLP

7  
8 By: /s/ Tod V. Beebe  
9 Tod V. Beebe, APC  
10 Attorneys for Defendant  
MUFG UNION BANK, N.A.

11 Dated: May 13, 2019

AIDAN W. BUTLER

12  
13 By: /s/ Aidan W. Butler  
14 Aidan W. Butler  
15 Attorneys for Plaintiff  
Alexandra Barilari

16 **FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

17  
18 DATED: 5/14/2019

19  
20 

21 JOHN E. McDERMOTT  
22 United States Magistrate Judge  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

**EXHIBIT A**

**ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND**

I, \_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full name], of  
\_\_\_\_\_ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury  
that I have read in its entirety and understand the Protective Order that was issued  
by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on  
\_\_\_\_\_ in the case of *Alexandria Barilari v. MUFG Union*  
*Bank; Trans Union, LLC*, U.S.D.C. Case No. 2:18-cv-8928 SJO (JEMx). I agree  
to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Protective Order and I  
understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to  
sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will  
not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Protective  
Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this  
Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District  
Court for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms  
of this Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after  
termination of this action. I hereby appoint \_\_\_\_\_ [print  
or type full name] of \_\_\_\_\_ [print or  
type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of  
process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of  
this Protective Order.

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

City and State where sworn and signed:

\_\_\_\_\_

Printed name: \_\_\_\_\_

Signature: \_\_\_\_\_